



**CITY OF DANIA BEACH
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
STAFF REPORT**

DATE September 27, 2011
TO Robert Baldwin, City Manager
FROM: Robert Daniels, Community Development Director
SUBJECT Building Inspection Services – Responses to Request for Proposals

Robert Daniels

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

Staff prepared and posted Request for Proposals (RFP) No. 11-006, which solicited proposals from qualified firms or persons to provide the City with Building Department Services. The City's Building Division is currently comprised of City employees and contract employees. The RFP is for contracted services only and does not apply to replacement of current city positions. Current city positions include one Building Inspector, two Permit Service Specialists and two Administrative Technicians.

The RFP was published on April 20, 2011. A pre-proposal conference was held on May 9, 2011. Representatives from twelve firms were present at the pre-proposal conference. The closing date for proposals was May 27, 2011. Proposals were received from the following firms.

Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.
1800 Eller Drive, Suite 600
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33316

C. A. P. Government, Inc.
8350 NW 52nd Terrace, Suite 209
Doral, FL 33166

M.T. Causley, Inc
97 East 15th Street
Homestead, FL 33030

Nova Engineering & Environmental
13800 NW 13th Street, Suite 130
Sunrise, FL 33323

A staff review committee made up of Colin Donnelly, Assistant City Manager, Dominic Orlando, Director of Public Service, Ronnie Navarro, City Engineer and Robert Daniels, Community Development Director met on June 17, 2011, June 30, 2011, July 12, 2011 and August 29, 2011 to assess the proposals. Proposals were evaluated using four criteria:

Approach and methodology – The firm's organization chart; its approach to provision of the Building Department services; the transition of the firm into the City's operations; and understanding of the requested service as outlined in the scope of services, which was included in the RFP.

Experience – The experience of the firm and the individuals nominated to be on the project team.

Cost Proposal - The hourly rate and review time frame.

Others – Financial standing and litigation history. Financial statements were reviewed by committee members and were submitted to the City's Finance Department for expert input.

A summary of the Committee's analysis of each of the firms is included below.

Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc (CGA)

- Approach and Methodology - the firm's organization chart provides for a Building Official (BO) with 27 years of experience as a manager of plan reviewers and inspectors. Redundancy is built into the BO position with the inclusion of a civil engineer and general contractor with 26 years experience. The team of inspectors/plan reviewers has lengthy experience in South Florida and all but two demonstrate experience in Broward County municipalities. The firm demonstrates an up-to-date technological approach, utilizing lap top computers in each inspector's vehicle, which allows for minor plan review in the field and real time exchange of plan information. A clear transition plan is provided and the firm demonstrates understanding of the scope of work outlined in the RFP.
- Experience – the firm has lengthy experience in Broward County in various disciplines. It's response indicates that the firm has 10 years experience in providing Building Department services. As stated above, the nominated personnel demonstrate adequate experience.
- Cost Proposal - Hourly charges for Building Official (\$105.60), Chief Inspector (\$67.20), Plans Examiner (\$67.50) and Inspector (\$66.00) were provided. All of the nominated personnel are qualified to provide inspection and plan review services. Charges for Building Official are the highest of the four firms submitting proposals. Plans Examiner charges are the lowest of the four firms. Over time charges are at 1.5 the standard hourly charge.
- Others – documentation provided indicates that this firm is financially stable. Litigation history indicates 5 recent cases with no judgments against the firm.

C.A.P. Government, Inc. (CAP)

- Approach and Methodology - the firm's organization chart provides for a Chief Building Official (CBO) with 37 years of experience as a manager of plan reviewers and inspectors in Broward County. The team's project manager, who has 29 years experience in construction project management and building department management and supervision would also provide electrical plans review. In addition to the management and supervisory personnel the firm provides for 13 experienced personnel in its staffing plan for Dania Beach. Descriptions of the firm's approach and transition plan demonstrate a clear and detailed understanding of the scope of services in the RFP.
- Experience – All nominated personnel have experience in South Florida municipalities and the team exhibits extensive experience in Broward County and its municipalities.
- Cost Proposals – the firm offers two options for compensation, hourly rates or a percentage of revenue. Hourly charges for Building Official (\$77.00), Plans Examiner (\$71.25), Chief Building Code Inspector (\$69.00) and Building Code Inspector (\$61.75) were provided. The firm provides a comparative analysis of its hourly rates versus Broward County's rates and commits to establishing

hourly rates that are at least five percent below those of the County. As an alternative the firm also offers a percentage of revenue method of compensation. Using this method the firm would retain an agreed upon percentage of the total monthly revenues received by the Building Department. The firm offers semi-annual review of the compensation package and guarantees that its services would be funded exclusively by permit fee revenues with no reliance on general fund revenues.

- Others – documentation provided indicates that this firm is financially stable. The firm's response to the RFP indicates no litigation, major disputes, contract defaults or liens during the 22 years the firm has been in existence.

M.T. Causley, Inc

- Approach and Methodology - the firm's organization chart provides for ten persons dedicated to the City of Dania Beach – five primary and five backup. In addition the firm's principal will act as project manager. The firm also provides a list of additional qualified staff to be available in the event the City requests to have a staff member removed. The transition plan proposed by the firm is clear and straightforward. The firm anticipates two weeks or less for the transition process.
- Experience - all personnel serve in the roles of plans examiner and inspector. All nominated personnel are experienced in South Florida, but in only one case is Broward County experience indicated.
- Cost Proposal – the firm's response to the RFP provides for hourly fees for Building Official (\$72.50), Chief Plans Examiners, Chief Inspectors, Plans Examiners and Inspectors would be charged at the same rate (\$68.00). The charge for Building Official is the lowest of the four firms responding and is significantly lower than the next higher bid. The charges for other personnel are roughly equivalent to those of the other firms except for CAP Government, which has a significantly lower charge for inspectors than all other respondents. Over time charges are at 1.5 the standard hourly charge.
- Others – financial documentation provided indicates that this firm is has operated at a deficit for the past two years. No litigation history was provided by the firm.

Nova Engineering and Environmental

- Approach and Methodology - the firm's organization chart provides for a team of twelve building department services staff including Building Officials, Plan Reviewers and Inspectors, lead by a project manager that is a structural engineer. Personnel would be provided by the firm from its existing staff and from a partner agency, Atkins North America (formerly PBS&J). While the proposal indicates an understanding of the City's needs, no transition plan was described.
- Experience – the team described in the proposal is highly qualified and exhibits great depth of experience. With few exceptions however, the experience is in project management and inspection with only three of the personnel having served as building inspectors in the employ of municipalities or school boards.
- Cost Proposal - the firm's response to the RFP provides for hourly fees for Building Official, referred to as "master code professional" (\$100.00), Plans Examiners (\$75.00), and Inspectors (\$65.00). The charge for Building Official is the second highest of the four firms responding. This firm applies a 1.5 multiplier

for over time for Monday – Saturday but unlike the other firms, it applies a multiplier of 2.0 for Sundays, holidays and disaster events.

- Others – financial documentation provided indicates that this firm has operated at a deficit for the past two years reported.

Reference calls on all of the above contractors yielded positive responses.

COMMITTEE RANKING

Pursuant to the requirements of the RFP the committee has selected and ranked the top 3 firms for the Commission's consideration.

1. CAP Government
2. M.T.Causley, Inc.
3. Calvin, Giordano and Associates, Inc.

BROWARD COUNTY CONTRACT RENEWAL PROPOSAL

In addition to the analysis on the RFP respondents staff has also reviewed a proposed renewal of the contract with Broward County, its current provider. Broward County has provided contract building code services for 16 years. The *Interlocal Agreement for Guaranteed Partial Service Building Code Services* (ILA) between the City and Broward County will expire on September 30, 2011. Broward County has a draft renewal ILA for the City's consideration. The agreement has been drafted as a five year agreement to expire in 2016, but the County acknowledges that the City may chose to shorten the term. Previous agreements have been for three year terms. Aside from the term no change to the ILA has been proposed.

Building code services provided by Broward County included the following.

Building Official	\$90.00/hr
Chief Building Inspector	\$80.50/hr
Plans Examiners	\$76.00/hr
Inspectors	\$66.00/hr

Over time is charged at 1.5 times the hourly rate for each position.

Based on the standard hourly charge the schedule of guaranteed services included in the ILA provides for potential annual charges of \$756,638.00. That maximum has not been realized in the life of the existing ILA. A summary of charges for the past three years is included below.

FY2010/11	\$420,930 (10/1/10 – 6/11)
FY2009/10	\$658,350
FY2008/09	\$718,827

COMPARISON OF BROWARD COUNTY AND RFP RESPONDERS

The committee performed an analysis of Broward County's proposal for contract renewal and compared it to the proposals received from the firms responding to the RFP.

Approach and methodology – the firms responding to the RPF all demonstrated a clear understanding of the RPF and submitted proposals for services similar to those currently being performed by Broward County. All of the top ranked firms submitted plans for a transition from County services to the firm’s services.

Experience – the personnel provided by Broward County have a proven record with the City of Dania Beach. The experience of the RFP responders varies as noted in the analysis outlined above for each firm. The no. 1 ranked firm (CAP) and the no. 3 ranked firm (CGA) demonstrate extensive experience in Broward County.

Cost Proposal - when the maximum hours included in the current ILA’s schedule of guaranteed services are applied all firms responding to the RFP would have lower charges than Broward County. A table of comparative maximum charges based on the ILA’s schedule of guaranteed services is included below.

Broward County	M.T. Causley, Inc.	Cap Government	Nova Engineering	Calvin, Giordanno & Associates, Inc
\$756,638	\$672,321	\$674,261	\$727,501	\$723,843

Others – financial standing and litigation history of each of the responding firms is included in the analysis above. Broward County offers the faith and credit of a public entity and a history of acceptable performance with the City. Financial documentation supplied by Broward County indicates a history of declining revenues and fund balances for the years submitted.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

Direct that an agreement be negotiated with CAP Government to include a percentage of revenue method of compensation

Ranking Summary

Date: August 29, 2011

Request for Proposals No. 11-006 Building Department Services

	R. Daniels	C. Donnelly	D. Orlando	RANKING
M T CAUSLEY	2	3	2	2
CAP GOVERNMENT	1	1	1	1
NOVA ENGINEERING & ENVIRONMENTAL	4	4	3	4
CALVIN, GIORDANO & ASSOC	3	2	4	3